

Checklist: Assessment of AI use cases in German news organizations		
Select a use case: _____		
Assessment Criteria + Propositions	Inspirational Quotes	
Part One: Main Assessment Criteria		
1. Relative Advantage		
Can you solve the problem without AI?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
It is always prudent to consider whether the news organization could solve the problem without AI, considering alternative solutions based on other strategies or technologies. For instance, SEO lines can be checked manually, text can be written directly by editors or paywalls can be replaced by discounts.	“In the end, the amount of work we have to do afterwards to correct or check this again. We have to ask ourselves is that right? What if we had simply researched it ourselves and written it down by hand?” (Publisher 10).	
Use cases with a clear relative advantage, solve a problem with AI. Typically, the greater the relative advantage is, the more widespread is the use case across newsrooms. For instance, time-saving AI projects like AI-generated short news or SEO lines, or algorithmic news curation are such very popular examples.	“So this is a huge gain in terms of time, which ensures that, on the one hand, the editorial team has the freedom it didn't have in previous times, which can be used differently and in a more value-adding way, which ensures that we have achieved a higher thematic density and thus build up more relevance” (Publisher 3).	
2. Business Model Compatibility		
Does the use case harm your business model?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
It is crucial to recognize that not all use cases are currently compatible with the business model of news organizations. Incompatibility partly explains hesitation towards use cases that spread inaccurate content or make traditional news websites obsolete. News organizations are free to reject use cases that harm their business model.	“[News curation] is actually able to bridge the disconnection between the newsrooms and the readership. We have the phenomenon that we now have very, very many journalists, very many newsrooms, where there is a feeling that their connection to reality, to society, to the readers for whom they write, is no longer so close and that [journalism] is a parallel world that is highly privileged. [Journalism] is nowhere near as diverse as the population and society [...]. And AI can actually form a bridge here and can incorporate aspects that perhaps in a certain biased newsroom, [would not have been selected]” (Expert 7).	
Use cases that are compatible with the business model, support and revitalize the existing value proposition. For instance, news curation and format versions are such supportive use cases.	“My opinion, however, is that if media companies make the mistake of relying on AI content too quickly and too unchecked and then make repeated and, above all, prominent mistakes in the texts, then trust will be lost relatively quickly, because I think [...] the texts are rather, I'll say it now, the sanctuary of the business case, which should not be compromised” (Publisher 7).	
Use cases that are incompatible with the business model, harm the value proposition. For instance, entirely AI-generated content, with its inaccuracies and hallucinations, is entirely incompatible with the value proposition of 100 % accurate and trustworthy content.	“What is actually our unique selling point, namely these exclusive stories, for which we also sell plus subscriptions. That doesn't really fit in with the idea of automatically playing a shortened version in the podcast free of charge, does it?” (Publisher 11).	
Use cases can have uncertain effects on the business model. For instance, chatbots could either boost subscription and advertisement revenue or make the traditional news website and app store on the long term completely redundant.		
Similarly, partnership deals that improve AI models could on the long term either establish a third revenue stream or shift consumer habits away from traditional formats towards AI models.		
Organizing a collaborative foresight workshop, such as those offered by the Swedish NGO Media Evolution, can help		

<p>develop a vision for the business model. These workshops help to identify features that use cases need to support the existing business model, to create a third revenue stream, or replace the current business model of news organizations.</p>		
<h3>3. Workflow Compatibility</h3>		
<p>How does the use case transform your workflow? Does the use case create new tasks?</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
<p>Answer: _ _ _ _ _</p>		
<p>Use cases compatible with workflows address pain points, such as an inconvenient and annoying repetitive task that the editorial team no longer wants to handle. As editorial units are often burdened with such routine tasks, many AI use cases in news organizations aim to optimize workflow routines.</p>	<p>“It’s not nice work, it’s extremely tedious and time-consuming and, above all, it’s error-prone. The manual production method is much more error-prone than the automated method. A text is recorded incorrectly, the speaker has to go into the sound box again. The emphasis is wrong, a formulation is incorrect, content is not correctly stored in the script. This immediately requires two or three further work steps” (Publisher 3).</p>	
<p>Use cases compatible with workflows integrate into existing channels like CMS or Microsoft Teams. There is significant potential for integrating transcription and translation tools into CMS, which is a common practice in Northern Europe.</p>	<p>“I wish there was a way to tell these people that this is not okay with me spending some time, effort, energy [with those tasks.] It’s a really, like, frustrating and unnecessary task for me” (Publisher 2).</p>	
<p>Use cases compatible with workflows are more convenient than existing solutions and create not too many new routine tasks.</p>	<p>“Of course, you can’t sell editors the AI as a great solution and then make more work for them afterwards than if they feed it manually” (Publisher 6).</p>	
<p>Use cases compatible with workflows coordinate new routine tasks. With more content versions and more automation, knowledge engineering tasks may increase. Job profiles, such as Chief Officers of Verification and Post-Editors may emerge (Calvo-Rubio & Rojas-Torrijos, 2024; Lindén, 2020). Other scholars suggested that those new roles might be less creative and demand less professionalism (Lindén, 2020), as interviewees argued in two cases.</p>		
<p>To check compatibility with workflows, news organizations develop a workflow chart that plays through every necessary step. This approach clarifies which employee needs to be involved, when, and how.</p>		
<h3>4. Compatibility with democratic mission</h3>		
<p>Does the use case strengthen the public value of your news products?</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
<p>Financial difficulties blurred the democratic mission of news organizations. The sample shows signs that some news organizations are neglecting their mission, by being mainly focused on profits and surviving.</p>	<p>“Google does still believe that an informed citizen makes for a better society. So it does do that. And it realizes that the information ecosystem, which includes news, the better, the healthier that is, the healthier it is for everybody, including society and also including Google, right?” (Expert 5).</p>	
<p>To strengthen the mission, news organizations select use cases that improve research standards, broaden topic selection beyond hobbies, enhance news gathering within local communities, provide context, include underrepresented groups, and update format versions. All the better if the selected AI project is also a business case.</p>	<p>“[In Silicon Valley] there are a lot of people who say that these media companies, for the most part, are just talking rubbish and making fun of people by making money with it”(Expert 7).</p>	
<p>AI use cases that only support business-oriented objectives, such as clickbait journalism or other quality-diminishing</p>		

practices such copy-paste or chatbots flooded with advertising, could lead to further disappointment among audiences and increase news avoidance even more (Lischka & Garz, 2023; Newman et al., 2024).	“So research today looks basically like that: you google and copy paste links and that’s just neither efficient nor sustainable” (Expert 4).	
A future marketing campaign could inform audiences on how AI is strengthening the social contract between journalists and civil society. For instance, a recent audio-marketing campaign by the New York Times tries something similar by addressing knowledge gaps in SEO and emphasizing its democratic mission (Schultheiß & Lewandowski, 2021).	“Well, it’s not the case that every topic that journalistically characterizes the day today or shapes current affairs or that perhaps starts the next debate is also what a reader would search for themselves or would click on next, because these are perhaps more topics that are based on hobbies or interests, not necessarily on current affairs, including things that are unpleasant and are therefore not initially searched for themselves per se” (Expert 7).	
In order to fulfill their democratic mission on long-term, news organizations may have to find a third revenue stream, eventually with AI (Mayer, 2024).		
5. Availability of Tech Expertise		
Can you build the use case in-house? If not, what expertise would you need to build it?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
	Answer: _ _ _ _ _	
Without in-house tech expertise, use cases are more likely to be abandoned or postponed. Individuals play a decisive role; parental leaves or career changes can determine the success of an entire use case.	“For the development, we were actually able to land and recruit a pretty brilliant programmer. [...] a graduate mathematician who is extremely well-versed in this area and with whom we also work very closely in our innovation team. And of course, and this is the big advantage, he has also gained a very deep and internal understanding of the processes through the proximity he has built up to our broadcaster during this process” (Publisher 3).	
As AI models are simple to customize and use, news organizations do not necessarily require AI-specific tech expertise, but general tech expertise.		
To attract tech talent, news organizations frame themselves in job advertisements as tech companies to appeal to potential employees with a Silicon Valley mindset (Schaez et al., 2024).		
To attract tech talent, news organizations target individual tech talent interested in responsible and impactful AI. Following the controversial release of ChatGPT, the workforce within large tech companies is divided between those favoring a more ethical AI development and those focused on business-oriented AI models (Metz, 2021). In addition / or instead of trying to become like tech companies, new organizations emphasize their positive impact.		
6. Availability of Structured Data		
Do you have enough structured data for the use case?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
Structured data improves the overall negotiation position of news organizations and increase the likelihood of selling data (E8).	“This is the only way that it becomes clear to the AI model operator that ah, okay, this is good data that I need, so to speak, and it costs so and so much. Otherwise, this treasure trove of data is simply hidden” (Expert 8).	
Structured data positions news organizations as the pioneer partner that improve AI models and reduces hallucinations.		
Structured data helps news organizations to prepare for future special-purpose models tailored to news content.		

<p>Additionally, it is worthwhile to explore a new business case focused on structuring and marketing data to both small and large AI companies.</p>	
<p>7. Employee-well-being</p>	
<p>How does this use case affect the well-being of your employees?</p>	<p>Answer: _____</p>
<p>To foster employee well-being, news organizations identify the tasks in which their employees excel or which they find most fulfilling. This insight allows news organizations to select AI use cases that align with existing profiles and enable strategic recruitment.</p>	<p>“So when the editor-in-chief goes through the editorial office, he hopefully says, I want to make a better program and I want to become more relevant in terms of content, thematically stronger, closer, closer to the people, more authentic, more credible, more opinionated, whatever. When the controller walks through the shop, he has his clipboard and the red pen with him and says ah great, you and you and you, I’ll get you off the payroll now” (Publisher 3).</p>
<p>To foster employee well-being, news organizations prioritize AI projects with delegative and co-creative human-machine-relationship. Automation may cause competition and unexpectedly alter job roles; from text, speech or video production towards ideation, news gathering, investigating, interviewing, co-creation, and final editing.</p>	<p>“That scratches the vanity of many of our comrades. But I think we’re fooling ourselves, we’re lying to ourselves if we believe that we’re all so brilliant, because we’re not. And in fact, I believe that an AI, if it is sufficiently trained, if it is operated properly and if you keep a watchful eye on it, is capable of doing a great deal of what we currently do” (Publisher 3).</p>
<p>To foster employee well-being, news organizations communicate potential shifts in job roles in advance. This will give employees the opportunity to switch career paths or up-skill in ideation, news gathering, investigating, interviewing, and co-creation.</p>	<p>“And creative means that you also think about things from time to time, how you want to approach them in a better and new way, want to research, want to plan and that is of course more likely to happen when you automate routines” (Publisher 11).</p>
<p>To foster employee well-being, news organizations explore how their employees interact with AI models. Current research urges that the co-creation of creative and paid writers is understudied (Doshi & Hauser, 2023). Good writers may only experience minimal improvements with LLMs, but the sense of responsibility and ownership may diminish even for those talented writers (Doshi & Hauser, 2023; Liu et al., 2022).</p>	<p>“First of all, we only use AI as a supporting tool” (Publisher 11).</p> <p>“Of course AI will not be able to do the research work. How could it, right? Exactly. Point” (Expert 6).</p>
<p>To foster employee well-being, news organizations draw inspiration from marketing professionals who pioneer (Woodruff et al., 2024) with so far impossible campaigns, like mixed reality (Bumpus, 2024) or underwater recordings (Moreno, 2024). The time saved through delegation could be used to explore unimaginable journalistic practices.</p>	
<p>8. Intensity of Competition</p>	
<p>How are competitors using the use case?</p>	<p>Answer: _____</p>
<p>Overall, competition among news organizations is intensifying.</p>	<p>“And now, yes, we’ve overslept everything, but I think we’re finally talking to each other about AI. Look, we did that wrong, don’t try it, it worked really well for us. Give it a try. The upper league says hey, we go together, but we are alone, (...), we can’t manage to defend ourselves against it or against this blatant market. Let’s take 20 more and form a front and then go in” (Publisher 10).</p>
<p>A few early adopters gained already a competitive advantage through partnership deals and automation. On top, competition is fueled by influencers, content farms, fake newsrooms, and tech entrepreneurs, that adopt generative AI with less reluctance.</p>	<p>“The public broadcasters are interested in something like this, but we wouldn’t give it to them [...] for the following reason - there is</p>

While influencers on social media platforms may normalize synthetic content, content farms are already polluting the internet with synthetic misinformation. Fake newsrooms soak up traffic, and tech entrepreneurs are constantly exploring new business opportunities by monetizing information.	no equality of arms between public and private broadcasting at the local level” (Publisher 3). “So of course, platforms like Spotify or whatever, they are pushing ahead and they don’t have any editorial credibility to think about, you know, because nobody trusts them as a publisher anyway. But we have to be more careful as a public service media company” (Expert 3)
To understand competitor’s actions, news organizations can seek allies both within and outside the industry.	“You know, if you are a Russian troll farm or, you know, an Iranian disinformation campaign, wow, generative AI is great for you, right?” (Expert 5).
To understand competitor’s actions, news organizations can explore potential outcomes of synthetic content. They can create new job openings and experiment with the same tools used by influencers, content farms or fake newsrooms.	“One of the new things that’s happening is that there’s a lot of people in tech at all levels, from individuals to startups to platforms, that are investing a lot of time and energy and money in news related, very different news related products” (Expert 1).
To understand competitor’s actions, news organizations prototype a journalist-free automated news website to examine the limitations of automation and identify future value propositions.	
To understand competitor’s actions, news organizations explore new business opportunities with information as a value proposition. For example, Elon Musk announced lately plans to create news content based on trend monitoring of social media posts and former journalist Francis Maroni sells insight from pharmaceutical trials to investors.	

9. Audience Readiness

How ready is your target audience for the use case?	Answer: _____
To understand audience readiness for format versions, news organizations monitor how other platforms shape early adopters’ readiness (Thurman et al., 2019). Younger audiences may become early adopter of cloned voices, avatars and various format versions that fit their multitasking media consumption.	“The problem is that I can’t see into the future. In other words, I would like to know how well AI-supported content is accepted by our customers” (Publisher 9). “We generated a news podcast in the morning based on our articles. And the success at first was that thousands of people listened to it. We thought wow, great, but these people often only came once” (Publisher 11).
To understand audience readiness for chatbots, news organizations assess whether early adopters are willing to establish a human-like connection with chatbots and whether they are satisfied with existing opinions. Audiences may prefer new opinions.	“And like, the question I have really deep in my mind is, like, on the surface of things that would then assume that AI doesn’t work for people because it isn’t a person, but it started to show so many personal characteristics when you engage with it. But maybe like a five year old now will talk to GPT 4 and, like, they will feel like a personal connection with that machine as much as they do another person” (Expert 2).
To understand audience readiness for chatbots, news organizations consider whether personalized chatbots from news organizations could engage with younger audiences that usually prefer individual content creators over prestigious news organizations	“Young people really want perspective and opinion. That’s something really difficult for, like, AI to replicate. I think it’s like they can mimic individuals, right? But they can’t, they can’t provide their own opinion on something because it’s obviously based on the training data” (Expert 2).
To shape audience readiness for this use case, news organizations inform audiences about the use case. Prior research suggests that a knowledge gap among audience is harming trust, as some believe all content is synthetic now (Fletcher & Nielsen, 2024).	

10. Sustainability

Why is the use case still relevant in 5 years’ time?	Answer: _____
---	---------------

<p>Currently, news organizations lack the strategic foresight skills necessary to create their own vision of an AI-mediated information ecosystem. Generative Search and partnership deals are two good examples of how most news organizations are passively waiting for the future instead of actively shaping a desirable one. However, under the surface some desirable futures are hiding and should be communicated with more self-confidence.</p>	<p>“But they’re not even in the game as far as imagining what this next phase is going to be like” (Expert 1).</p>
<p>To build sustainable use cases, news organizations conduct ideally once per week a desirable future foresight workshop.</p>	<p>“[...] the financial situation of local news is so extreme and dire that all they can think about is revenue optimization in a very short time. Unfortunately, that lack of long termism to create a better product is what’s going to kill them because Google’s algorithm changes, they roll out like generative search, which they’re going to. Those publishers lose 20% to 25% of their traffic and all of a sudden, like, they can’t sustain an ad driven model, so I don’t know what they’re going to do” (Expert 2).</p>
<p>To build sustainable use cases, news organizations gather as much information as possible on product launches by tech companies.</p>	<p>“And in the end, even if you can’t know Google’s next step, you can basically estimate trends and you basically know where the journey is going, what skills there are in the sector and where they are basically developing and you can already have a rough picture, two or three future scenarios, and build your own vision based on that” (Expert 4).</p>
<p>To build sustainable use cases, news organizations evaluate the potential of a polluted information system and handmade journalism.</p>	<p>“I can only say with popcorn, because yes, I only read what’s in the newspaper or on portals or something and it would be really interesting to be there” (Publisher 6).</p>
<p>To build a sustainable use cases, news organizations evaluate chatbot agents, LLMs without hallucinations, avatars conducting interviews, journalists as scriptwriters for influencers like in Hollywood, publishers acting as high-quality influencer agencies, newsroom run by an individual, a future without smartphones, app stores and URLs boredom on TikTok and news business models around an advertisement case.</p>	<p>“These deals are between really, really, really large tech companies and really, really large media companies” (Expert 5).</p>
<p>To build sustainable use cases, news organizations, reassess the effectiveness of SEO and clickbait journalism and whether generative search optimization could be more beneficial.</p>	<p>“And in principle, everyone was initially of the opinion that we were preventing this, that we didn’t want it. And Springer are seen as the pioneers who said, well, we at least want to have money for it before we are overrun or pull something out of this cooperation. The New York Times is just going the other way and now everyone will probably just wait and see what happens over the next few years and Springer is now getting a head start, starting in the next two years and then having something when the others are just getting started” (Expert 6).</p>
<p>To build sustainable use cases, news organizations address the challenge of generative search, with one-third of traffic and advertisement revenue potentially breaking away. News organizations explore strategies to drive the subscription model or establish a third revenue stream. They are aware of the declining relevance of apps and URLs (Borchardt et al., 2024).</p>	<p>“So what I wish is that there’s an open licensing model for grounding and potentially real time data that both the small publishers could participate in. But also, and this is another point that I think gets forgotten so that small tech companies” (Expert 5)</p>
<p>To build a sustainable third revenue stream, news organizations adopt a proactive community approach and avoid a prisoner’s dilemma by considering an open-licensing model that includes small publishers and small tech companies (Lischka & Garz, 2023).</p>	<p>“I don’t think that’s healthy for the overall ecosystem because, you know, the actual Springers of the world, they’re taking the money for themselves and fair play to them, they’re very intelligent, very smart, but they’re taking the money for themselves as much as they can get, which means there’s less for everybody else” (Expert 5).</p>
<p>To build a sustainable third revenue stream, news organizations assess how the business model of AI companies might develop and how deals might evolve.</p>	

Part Two: Assessment Criteria - drivers of psychological pressure

11. Industry Standards

Do you feel like the use case can keep up with industry standards?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
	Answer: _____	

News industry upheld very strong professional ethics compared to other content creators. With the launch of generative AI the industry is renegotiating standards, mostly through individual yet very similar guidelines (Becker et al., 2023).	“We would never do that now. That would also violate our policy. AI alone doesn’t make the final decision for us. [...] First of all, AI is only used for support. In other words, when it comes to journalism, it is always the human being, the reporter, the topic manager, who approves the text” (Publisher 9).
To uphold professional ethics, news organizations recognize the dynamic and incomplete nature of industry standards and may find it helpful to approach industry standards similar to food standards.	“[AI-generated] short news only if it really isn’t a serious story. Of course, reporters have to check things, for example if a criminal case becomes real or if a major accident occurs, then we are on site ourselves and we don’t let AI guess” (Publisher 11).
To uphold professional ethics, news organizations realize that there are already new standards, such as the „editor in the loop“ or the announcement of cloned voices and avatars at the beginning of the format.	“What you can do, however, is a kind of positive list, which is not my opinion, but a scientific opinion, which I also support. You can make a positive list that says, yes, the content here was created by people and someone is responsible for it and I’ll mark it in a certain way or even archive it somehow so that other people who want to consume it are one hundred percent sure that this content comes from a certain reputable source” (Expert 8).
To uphold professional ethics, news organizations agree together on a definition of synthetic content and introduce a journalistic seal of approval.	“And no editor can tell me that he doesn’t read through his text again before submitting it. So the discussion is far too easy on this quality front or this fear. I just find it a wonderful way to occupy myself at the end of the day” (Expert E6).
To uphold professional ethics, news organizations address whether co-created content is considered synthetic, whether co-created content is qualified for journalistic seal of approval, and how editors are allowed to use AI models.	“That again, you know, that’s the horrible, you know, horrible to say this, but it’s like you think about something like food standards. You know, in most western countries, there’s a certain amount of spider legs that you’re allowed in your sausage, right? Because you can’t have everything perfect. And I think there’s a version of that in the tech company world. And there’s an aversion to that in the news world. But the reality is that no news companies ever been perfect” (Expert 5).
To uphold professional ethics, news organizations investigate, whether editors have incentives to hide their use of AI models. News organizations determine the consequences for presenting AI-generated as original work.	
News organizations keep in mind that the current taboo of automation may not remain a common standard for every news organization.	

12. Availability of Trustworthy AI Models

Do you trust AI model providers? If not, how could your organization manage doubts?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
	Answer: _____	

<p>News organizations must learn to manage the untransparent nature of training data and the fear of accidentally sharing data they intend to sell. Apparently small news organizations that do not intend to sell data can act more pragmatic and have less doubts about using AI models.</p>	<p>“So the current benchmarks somehow exist where providers of models throw numbers around. [...] And this quality test is super complex and it doesn’t help when the next provider comes along and says that our model was tested with 7.5 billion parameters and our fine-tuning is the best. So we lack transparency about the data basis. We have no idea how it was trained” (Publisher 5).</p> <p>“For companies, they come with the promise that this data will not be used to train the model. Why do I say promise? Well, because no one can control it” (Expert 6).</p>	
<p>To manage doubts, news organizations are aware of the European Digital Service Act, which prohibits AI companies using locked data from private companies for training purposes.</p>		
<p>To manage doubts, news organizations seek trustworthy data privacy commitments. European AI models have the potential to establish themselves as a reliable alternative in the long term.</p>		
<p>To manage doubts, news organizations recognize that the origins of training data are not likely to disappear soon. In the meantime, news organizations use various evaluation tools that help to choose suitable models, e.g. HELM, TruthfulQA or HaluEval (Perrault, R. & Clark, J., 2024).</p>		
<p>To manage doubts, news organizations weigh the risk of falling behind against the risk of accidentally sharing data they intend to sell.</p>		
<h3>13. Legislation</h3>		
<p>How does legislation affect the use case?</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
	<p>Answer: _____</p>	
<p>The European Digital Service Act mandates that AI model providers must respect copyright law for locked data and confirms that it is illegal to use stolen training data. However, the legal consequence for defamation in their names and for past copyrights infringement by AI companies remains uncertain. So does the provenance of used training data.</p>	<p>“Exactly, then there are downstream obligations and that’s where it will be really interesting, because as a model provider, you have to be able to show where and with what data you have trained and the AI Office, which is currently being staffed by the Commission, can demand in some way that large model providers provide this data situation, these sources. Which, in turn, allows conclusions to be drawn about the quality of the models” (Expert 8).</p> <p>“Then, what is also interesting, is that AI model providers must also respect copyright. This is explicitly stated. In particular, those who declare a reservation of use, may not be used, neither for training nor in any other way. The reservation of use is the following: you have to say in machine-readable form that I do not want this data, it belongs to me and I do not want it to be trained. That’s also interesting. So the legislator assumes in some way that there is already a kind of data market and that also applies to journalistic data” (Expert 8).</p>	
<p>To navigate legal uncertainty, news organizations can play through the expected benefits of training data transparency. They need to determine whether anything would be different and if it is crucial for the use case or rather for the compensation.</p>		
<p>To navigate legal uncertainty, news organizations can ask how illegal training data use or defamation in their name impacts this particular use case.</p>		
<p>To navigate legal uncertainty, news organizations play through the likelihood of receiving compensation. If compensation seems likely, news organizations can consider creating a Marchall Plan for News in co-creation with readers.</p>		
<p>Only five experts mentioned legal uncertainties, suggesting that fourteen interviewees avoided the topic. News organizations could benefit from organizing a workshop parliament discussion on AI regulations (e.g. offered by the French company Deb´Acteur), reducing complexity for non-legal experts.</p>		

Part Three: Additional Meta Assessment Criteria

14. Attractiveness for Collaborations

Could the use case inspire other industries and suppliers to collaborate?

yes

no

Answer: _ _ _ _ _

Problematic collective behavior from the past may carry over into new relationships and turn off national entrepreneurs and start-ups alike. That poses a problem because, since from a tech perspective, AI projects in German news organizations are already not particularly attractive.

“OpenAI are the only ones out there who are currently making any deals at all. Google is keeping a very low profile. Meta is a long way away, they don't deal with media companies at all and don't want to. They all get a rash or something when they skin hear media companies” (Expert 7).

To increase the attractiveness of future collaborations with tech, news organizations stop framing themselves as tech-averse and avoid collective gossiping about tech companies.

“You stole all this content from other people and you're giving a lot of false information. You know, for a publisher that gives me the chills, you know, whereas for them it's like, hey, that's how you have to launch new technology. So it's very different kind of ethical systems meeting each other” (Expert 5).

To increase the attractiveness of future collaborations with tech, news organizations learn from past mistakes, which have left both news organizations and tech companies upset. Individuals listen to the oral history from Riptide, a unique interview collection of tech leaders and media makers from the early 21st century, explaining what went wrong (Huey et al., 2013).

“That also reminds me of when I was at the Federal Association of Newspaper Publishers last year and then the whole day was spent ranting about OpenAI, the data cloud and how it doesn't work at all and we have to block it at all costs because this big old Google fear still prevails. And back then and now we're just in a state of reactance to it and somehow late in the afternoon there was a presentation where someone said, so and so far published, by the way, these are the sources that OpenAI used. And what a surprise, not a single German news site was included. In other words, people were upset for a day that they were stealing the data and then it wasn't even like that” (Expert 6).

To increase the attractiveness of future collaborations with tech, news organizations create a white paper to explain to the tech sector why collaboration is worthwhile. Such a report would foster a reset, a new narrative and a do-it-yourself attitude known from software engineers.

To increase the attractiveness of future collaborations with tech, news organizations assess gap year opportunities within newsrooms for tech leads, allowing them to explore their creative writing skills and to become a fan of the industry. News organizations market their attractiveness through their intellectual legacy and the courageous spirit of foreign and investigative correspondents.

“The way I've got to know the industry, I've kind of buried DIY for myself, I think that's a shame. The industry is somewhere simply too conservative for that and needs to take a new approach” (Expert 4).

15. Organizational Structure

Do you have AI-specific structures for the use case?

yes

no

AI units positively impact the adoption of AI technologies. Although the long-term effects of increased power within AI units are uncertain.

“Then we've realized that we also get a lot of questions internally from people who don't know exactly which tool we can use now, for what? So they all call us and say, hey, help me decide, is this okay or not? And of course that's a workflow that paralyzes everyone, it's totally bad, but you have to make it so that people can decide for themselves” (Publisher 1).

Typically, the hierarchical structure of news organizations remain unchanged. More authoritative organization may obligate employees to experiment, whereas less authoritative might offer employees a choice.

To tailor a new organizational structure, news organizations merge AI-focused units, teams, departments, spaces, councils, labs or individual roles with pre-existing structures. Those teams usually elaborate guidelines which encourages

“So, the individual editors who work with it naturally decide whether the content output is usable, that is the operational decision, someone has to approve it. And we decided to use this [technologies] in the editorial office

<p>employees to take own decisions, collect use cases in an open database and assist other departments in selecting experiments that align with the overall strategy.</p>	<p>and had the guidelines developed there and also gave our colleagues the freedom to experiment. However, these guidelines also impose restrictions and we have also decided what is not possible. For example, content created predominantly by AI or entirely by AI cannot be published” (Publisher 11).</p>	
<p>To tailor a new organizational structure, news organizations position AI teams as evangelists who demonstrate top management’s support for AI projects of committed individuals and encourage bottom-up innovation. Also at Google innovation happens while working (Steiber & Alänge, 2013).</p>		
<p>News organizations avoid tensions and power struggles between AI teams and the news organization by closely monitoring unwanted dynamics, along with promoting up-skilling and career development across age groups and units (Goyanes & Cañedo, 2023).</p>		
<p>16. Cultural Readiness</p>		
<p>Is your culture ready for the use case? If not, how do you get ready?</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
<p>To foster a culture of innovation, news organizations embrace AI as a second chance, acknowledging missed opportunities at the beginning of the 21st century (Huey et al., 2013; Russell, 2019).</p>	<p>Answer: _ _ _ _ _</p>	
<p>To foster a culture of innovation, news organizations avoid status quo investment and invest in forward-thinking AI projects.</p>	<p>“It simply has a bit to do with the market situation. So maybe you just can't really afford innovation They're not hostile to innovation or anything, they just use up their resources. The decision is, we just make a good product and we don't do the other things. That's okay, I can kind of understand that” (Expert 8).</p>	
<p>To foster a culture of innovation, news organizations abandon arrogant attitudes rooted in a glorious past. Recognizing that publishers are not anymore among the most affluent and influential families (Huey et al., 2013; Russell, 2019), they understand that dominance thinking, airs and graces, defiance, overconfidence about the own actions and the own writing skills, negatively impact an innovative culture.</p>	<p>“So I had to come up with arguments in advance, so to speak, that convinced the management that it made sense to take a closer look. The arguments against it were a bit of dominance thinking, we are the experts and so on. The usual arguments, which I have been familiar with in the media business for 25 years” (Publisher 4).</p>	
<p>To foster a culture of innovation, news organizations organize role playing exercises where employees imagine working for an unknown start-up and devalue their prestigious brands.</p>	<p>“And on the other hand, there are many journalists who are firmly convinced that tech people should go down on their knees for the honorable work they do all day and don't understand why it is not appreciated” (Expert 7).</p>	
<p>To foster a culture of innovation, news organizations explore how other industries that faced decline or conservatism, successfully built on their legacy. “Nostalgic marketing” in the Italian food industry and fashion industry or “authenticity and prestige marketing” within the French wine industry might be such cases (Heine et al., 2016; Rovai & Carlo, 2023).</p>	<p>“And I think one of the big learnings was that journalists were very focused on power and the loss of power from AI” (Expert 1).</p>	
<p>It may help to approach innovation like journalistic investigations: without the right sources and the right mindset it is hard to land an innovation scoop.</p>	<p>“I suggest to them is you let go of the past. You know, just, you know, it doesn't matter anymore. You got, you got to imagine you're starting from scratch now and, you know, all that tradition, all that, you know, experience for print, all of it, you know, be discounted, devalue it, you know” (Expert 1).</p>	

17. Communication Strategy	
How will you communicate the use case?	Answer: _____
Three main features of generative AI – low complexity, observability and trialability – provide a solid foundation for a successful communication campaign, spreading motivation and appetite for innovations across the organization.	<p>“I have a background in [...] data journalism [...] And I mean, five years ago, ten years ago, you definitely had to learn how to use [...] programming languages. [...] And I realized through this project that [...] you ask GPT to do something to give you a code about something that you want to do, and it gives you the code perfectly. So some stuff that [...] used to take three, four days” (Publisher 2).</p> <p>“At the same time, they try to somehow take the AI hype with them and then do some really weird experiments that absolutely fail” (Expert 4).</p> <p>“You know, there's one of these things where it's easy to do a demo and it's easy to test the demo or a prototype with audiences, but it's much, much harder to do it routinely in production” (Expert 1).</p> <p>“And now there is also, let's say, a second stage of dealing with AI in terms of content. Up to now, we have always accompanied, questioned and critically scrutinized AI as a topic in terms of content. Now we are considering, or there are already some very specific productions on the way to completion, actually making programs with AI in order to learn more about the use of AI in the audiovisual field, so to speak, and what that actually means” (Publisher 4).</p>
To spread enthusiasm for a use case, news organizations incorporate easy, observable and triable experiments into their communication strategy.	
To spread enthusiasm for a use case, news organizations capture employees’ interest with hands-on demonstrations. These allow even the most technology-averse journalists to discover that their eloquence and creativity are a real asset.	
To spread motivation for a use case, news organizations address potential frustrations and fears about new, undesirable editing tasks by introducing news careers milestones such as workshops, AI awards, team competitions, side projects or fellowships (Grimme, 2022). Fellowships, like Axel Springer’s residencies in tech metropolis, or AI gap years allow employees to discover foreign AI hubs and become an AI Translator (Borchardt et al., 2024).	
To spread enthusiasm for a use case, news organizations enable journalists (in workshops or real life) to cover AI topics. This approach helps organizations to gain new insights, up-skill their workforce, prevent conflicts related to unequal up-skilling (Goyanes & Cañedo, 2023). However, this option should be carefully discussed, as journalism about AI has several pitfalls, such as attributing agency to machines or repeating PR-terms (Dandurand et al., 2023).	
18. Market Position	
Does your market position provide an advantage for this use case?	Answer: _____
While size used to be a decisive factor for innovations, it is not anymore. AI models increase accessibility and require less technical skills compared to previous technologies.	<p>“And so before ChatGPT, the first era of AI and news, [...] it was only really accessible to very large news organizations with a lot of funding. It required, like data warehouses, data scientists, and big projects labs, you know, special groups of people whose job it was to, to do prototyping. [...] But that era is gone like it's dying, right? [...] So it's a different era” (Expert 1).</p> <p>“At Axel Springer, they would have a mega AI department, we don't have one. We just have relatively lean IT in the editorial department, relatively lean AI expertise and it is of course much more complex than both players, for example” (Publisher 9).</p> <p>“This means that AI, this careful, transparent, responsible use of AI, is really something of a last resort for media companies of our size, especially in the local and regional sector. If</p>
Large companies continue to benefit from their resources, enabling them to establish dedicated AI units and AI deals. For example, Axel Springer uses its negotiation power to secure advantageous partnerships deals.	
Local publishers could thrive in a start-up-like market position and benefit from their community presence to create valuable AI services. For example, Studio 47 from Duisburg transformed into a startup-like entity by launching a software to create TV-segments within minutes.	
Local publishers that are rather medium-sized enterprises profit neither from partnership deals, nor from a dynamic start-up environment. However, in the long term deep	

<p>embedment in communities could become a central value proposition of special-purpose models and AI agents (E8).</p>	<p>we don't do this, we will find that the local providers, the regional providers, won't be able to hold out for much longer" (Publisher 3).</p>
<p>Freelance journalists benefit from the increased accessibility of AI technologies. For instance, the freelance video journalist Sophia Smith Galer developed a new income stream by creating an AI model for viral videos based on her own viral content (Smith Galer, 2024).</p>	